

**Property Location:**        **432 Chautauqua Avenue**  
Chautauqua Historic District  
Lot 8 Block 1 of Rossø Addition

**COA Request:**                **(HD Case 16-10)** Consideration of a request for a  
Certificate of Appropriateness to install shutters on the  
garage for the property located at 432 Chautauqua  
Avenue.

**Applicant/Owner:**        Joe & Donna Jo Foote  
432 Chautauqua Ave, OK 73069

## **A. Background:**

1. **Historical Information:** This property currently has a new primary structure and garage under construction and therefore there is not any historical information regarding this property.

2. **Property History:**

**December 1, 2014** . HDC approved the relocation of the house that straddled Lots 7 and 8 Block 1 of Rossø Addition addressed as 428 Chautauqua, thereby creating a vacant lot (Lot 8), which was then subsequently addressed as 432 Chautauqua.

**February 2, 2015** . (HD 15-02) HDC approved a COA request for an infill house on Lot 8 Block 1 of Rossø Addition. Construction of house is currently in progress.

**May 4, 2015** . (HD 15-02a) HDC approved an amendment request to HD 15-02 for revisions to placement of windows and denied the amendment request to add a front yard driveway and parking.

**May 4, 2015** . (HD 15-08) HDC approved a COA request for new garage, associated parking pad and fence in rear yard. Construction of the garage is currently in progress.

**September 3, 2016** . (HD -1610) HDC approved a COA request for a swimming pool, shutters on the principal structure, paved stoops, and front sidewalk.

3. **Project Description:**

In September the applicant requested a COA from the Historic District Commission for shutters for the new house recently completed at this address. The applicants realized that they wished to have the shutters on the garage to

match the house and they are now returning to the Historic District Commission seeking approval of the request. The applicant is proposing the same wood shutters that were approved for the house for the garage. The shutters will serve a decorative purpose only.

## **B. Analysis of Request:**

The following sections of the *Historic Preservation Handbook* are applicable to this application request:

### **2.7 Guidelines for Non-Contributing Resources**

*.1 Preservation Guidelines Apply. The Historic Preservation Guidelines apply to all structures in Norman's Historic Districts, both contributing and non-contributing.*

*.2 Support Harmony Between Old and New. Non-contributing structures shall be controlled only to the degree necessary to make them compatible with the general atmosphere of the district with regard to alterations, additions, changes to the site, and the like. As with all requests for certificates of appropriateness in historic districts, each project will be evaluated on its own merits for overall impact on the district as a whole.*

### **4.3 Guidelines for New Primary Structures**

*.1 Consider Historic Context. Design new structures to be compatible with historic buildings in the district in terms of size, scale, height, form, massing, proportion, finished floor elevation, size of door and window openings, and roof shape. Proposals for new construction shall include streetscape elevation drawings that depict proposed structure as well as elevations of properties on either side to provide a comparison of massing, scale, and design.*

*.2 Select Doors & Windows Carefully. Select doors and windows for new buildings that are compatible in material, proportion, pattern, and detail with the doors and windows of historic buildings in the district. See Chapter 3.5 Doors and Windows.*

*.3 Select Compatible Finishes. Select materials and finishes for proposed new buildings that are compatible with historic materials and finishes found in historic buildings in the district in terms of composition, scale, pattern, detail, texture, and finish.*

The *Historic Preservation Handbook* does not specifically address the installation of shutters. While shutters do not require a building permit, the Historic District Ordinance does require a Certificate of Appropriateness for all exterior alterations, including those on new, non-contributing structures. As such, guidance can be drawn from the above mentioned sections:

**Section 2.7 Guidelines for Non-Contributing Resources and  
Section 4.3 Guidelines for New Primary Structures**

**Staff Comments:**

1. The primary structure and the garage on this property are new construction and are non-contributing structures to the Chautauqua Historic District.
2. The property is an interior lot facing Chautauqua Avenue, a local street. The lot has an alley running the length of the rear (west) property line.
3. The front and side elevations of the newly constructed house are the primary elevations of concern. The visibility of the garage from the front is limited by the principal structure.
4. The proposed wood shutters will be the same as the shutters previously approved for the house. As indicated by the rendering provided, the shutters will be rectangular shape, the same height as the existing windows and approximately half the width of the existing windows.

**Staff Recommendations:**

Staff would recommend approval of the COA request for the installation of shutters for the garage for the property located at 432 Chautauqua Avenue as submitted based upon the following observations:

1. Review of new construction and alterations to non-contributing structures is required to ensure compatibility with the district.
2. The garage shutters will have limited visibility from the front streetscape and items located in the rear are reviewed to a lesser degree since they have less impact on the district.
3. The shutters will match the house shutters. The proposed shutters are proportional to the existing windows. The rectangular shape is an appropriate shape for the existing windows. Wood is an appropriate material that is compatible with the district.

**Staff Recommendation:** Since the proposed shutters will match the existing house shutters, are appropriate in proportion, size, shape and material and will have limited visibility from the front streetscape, staff finds they are compatible with district and recommends approval as submitted.

**Action Required:** Motion to approve or reject the Certificate of Appropriateness Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of shutters on the garage for property located at 432 Chautauqua Avenue.